

**Shawn McElmurry**

**From:** Shawn McElmurry  
**Sent:** Thursday, December 15, 2016 10:49 AM  
**To:** Nancy Love  
**Subject:** RE: FW: URGENT - Re: Wayne State Community Meeting in Flint

Could we talk at 11:15am?

Shawn P. McElmurry, PhD, PE  
Associate Professor  
Wayne State University

----- Original message -----

**From:** Nancy Love <nglove@umich.edu>  
**Date:** 12/15/16 10:43 AM (GMT-05:00)  
**To:** Shawn McElmurry <s.mcelmurry@wayne.edu>  
**Cc:** Paul Kilgore <paul.kilgore@wayne.edu>, "Benjamin Pauli (bpauli@kettering.edu)" <bpauli@kettering.edu>, "Laura Sullivan (dr.laura2@gmail.com)" <dr.laura2@gmail.com>, Marcus Zervos <MZERVOS1@hfhs.org>, Matthew Seeger <matthew.seeger@wayne.edu>  
**Subject:** Re: FW: URGENT - Re: Wayne State Community Meeting in Flint

To be clear from my point of view:

1. No new information was presented. Indeed, I held off on new information because we had not discussed it with Eden, Pam, etc. Shawn, you seemed to imply there was new information in one email, but I don't think there was anything Eden didn't hear about from me and I was very careful to contain my message with that in mind. Eden knows we had bacterial increases across filters (her reaction to that motivated my first slide). Eden knows we looked for, but did not detect [REDACTED]. Eden knows we saw high levels of [REDACTED] and are trying to understand the implication (I mentioned at the GCMS meeting and she was briefed by CDC on our call with them). So, what is new?
2. I remain perplexed how the information about the increase in bacteria across the filters is a surprise. Not only have we discussed this with them before, especially during the "you are going to release shigella data" kerfuffle, but did they not read ANY literature about filters before they decided to deploy 24,000 of them in Flint? Literature, papers, NSF Standards? Anything? This should not be a surprise and was the public health community's responsibility when they decided to deploy an intervention that they do not understand.
3. I think I was balanced and measured and clear. Counts go up (not unusual for these filters) and we are looking at who those bacteria are. Again, this is absolutely not new. The only thing that is new is that the general public, not just those who we sampled, are now aware of what the state should have told citizen's was a risk from the beginning.

**Nancy G. Love, Ph.D., P.E., BCEE**  
Borchardt and Glysson Collegiate Professor  
Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, University of Michigan  
Adjunct Professor, Addis Ababa University Institute of Biotechnology, Ethiopia  
Fellow: Water Environment Federation; International Water Association; Association of Environmental Engineering and Science Professors